

/ inclusiv./ CDFI Office Hours

Pre-Approved Target Market Verification Methodologies



Pre-Approved Target Market Verification Methodologies

- Comments on are due by December 19th
- Significant changes needed for credit unions to remain certified

/inclusiv_/



CDFI Fund Notices and Information

https://www.cdfifund.gov/news/489



/ inclusiv./



CDFI Fund Notices and Information

https://www.cdfifund.gov/news/489



In an effort to increase transparency and reduce burden through the revised CDFI Certification Application the CDFI Fund intends to publish a list of pre-approved Target Market assessment methodologies that Applicants and Certified CDFIs may use and rely upon to demonstrate that they are serving their identified Target Market(s). Only those Target Market assessment methodologies that have been approved by the CDFI Fund may be used when compiling Target Market data under the revised CDFI Certification Application. Through the revised CDFI Certification Application and Annual Certification and Data Collection Report, Applicants and Certified CDFIs will select from a drop-down menu the options in the methodology list that they used for each of their Target Market components (i.e., Investment Area, Low-Income Targeted Population, or Other Targeted Population).





Target Market(s).

CDFI Fund Notices and Information

https://www.cdfifund.gov/news/489



Through a Request for Comment (RFC), the CDFI Fund seeks feedback from the public on the proposed list of pre-approved Target Market assessment methodologies. The CDFI Fund also seeks any additional information members of the public believe would assist the CDFI Fund in establishing policies and procedures related to the Target Market assessment methodologies. The CDFI Fund intends to consider the feedback received through this RFC prior to establishing a final list of pre-approved Target Market assessment methodologies. Please note, the CDFI Fund will not automatically retain previously accepted Target Market assessment methodologies that do not appear on the list of **Proposed Pre-Approved**Target Market Assessment Methodologies (provided below). Applicants that seek to use an alternative or modified methodology will be permitted to submit a service request through AMIS for consideration of that process to the CDFI Fund.





Target Market(s).

CDFI Fund Notices and Information

https://www.cdfifund.gov/news/489



Through a Request for Comment (RFC), the CDFI Fund seeks feedback from the public on the proposed list of pre-approved Target Market assessment methodologies. The CDFI Fund also seeks any additional information members of the public believe would assist the CDFI Fund in establishing policies and procedures related to the Target Market assessment methodologies. The CDFI Fund intends to consider the feedback received through this RFC prior to establishing a final list of pre-approved Target Market assessment methodologies. Please note, the CDFI Fund will not automatically retain previously accepted Target Market assessment methodologies that do not appear on the list of Proposed Pre-Approved Target Market Assessment Methodologies (provided below). Applicants that seek to use an alternative or modified methodology will be permitted to submit a service request through AMIS for consideration of that process to the CDFI Fund.





CDFI Fund Notices and Information

https://www.cdfifund.gov/news/489



Related Materials:

- Federal Register Notice
- Proposed Pre-Approved Target Market Assessment Methodologies
- · Low-Income Targeted Population Geographic Proxy: List of all qualifying census block groups
- Low-Income Calculator
- · Hispanic Surnames: List of all qualifying surnames for OTP-Hispanic Designation
- Pre-Approved Methodologies
- Low-Income Geographic Proxies
- Low-Income Calculator
- Hispanic Surnames

/ inclusiv./



/ Target Market Verification / Pre-Approved Methodologies

Proposed Pre-Approved Target Market Assessment Methodologies

Target Market Type: OTP-African American

Recipient Type Eligibility

- Individual: At least 50% of the individuals named as recipients in the Financial Product and/or Financial Services transaction agreement are assessed as African American.
- For-Profit Entity: If all parties named as recipients in the Financial Product and/or
 Financial Services transaction agreement are for-profit entities that are wholly owned by
 one or more individuals (i.e., are not owned in whole or in part by another entity) and are
 not tax exempt, at least 50% of the owners named as recipients are assessed as African
 American
- Nonprofit Entity: If all parties named as recipients in the Financial Product and/or
 Financial Services transaction agreement are tax exempt, at least 50% of the end-user
 recipients of the Financial Product and/or Financial Services transaction are assessed as
 African American.

Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

- OTP-AA.1 Individual, owner, or end-user self-reports as African American.
- OTP-AA.2 If the individual/owner/end-user self-report is not available, the financing
 entity visually assesses an individual's status as African American in-person or via
 collection of a government-issued photo identification.

Documentation/Record Keeping Requirements

- CDFI or Applicant CDFI must have policies describing the assessment processes used to determine the transaction is Target Market directed.
- CDFI or Applicant CDFI should maintain its records for a minimum of 5 years.

Guidance

- African American is defined by the CDFI Fund's CDFI/NACA program as "a person having origins in any of the black racial groups of Africa."
- If the status of the individual as a member of the OTP based on an in-person visual assessment or the government-issued photo ID is uncertain, the individual/owner/enduser should not be counted as such.
- All individuals named as recipients of the Financial Product will be counted as separate
 individuals when determining the overall percentage of those that qualify for this OTP,
 even if they are part of the same family, household or entity.
- Nonprofit end-user verification the nonprofit entity must assess the percentage of end
 users who receive the service that are members of the Target Market. The financing
 entity must verify that the nonprofit is using one of the pre-approved methods in order to
 count the transaction as Target Market directed.

- 23 Page document with detailed description of Target Market Verification methodologies that the CDFI Fund would consider as "pre-approved"
- Our analysis indicates that no credit union currently certified for Low-Income (LITP) and/or Other Targeted Population (OTP) would be able to recertify with these methodologies alone

¹ The CDFI Fund relies on the definitions established in the <u>Revisions to the Standards for Classification of Federal Data on Race and Ethnicity (OMB Statistical Policy Directive No. 15).</u>



Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

- **OTP-AA.1** Individual, owner, or end-user self-reports as African American.
- OTP-AA.2 If the individual/owner/end-user self-report is not available, the financing entity visually assesses an individual's status as African American in-person or via collection of a government-issued photo identification.



Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

• **OTP-Native American.1** – The financing entity assesses an individual/owner/end-user's status as Native American with maintained Tribal affiliation or community attachment via collection of a government-issued or Tribal government-issued photo identification or documentation as described below.

- (ii) Documents described in <u>paragraph (a)(5)(i)</u> of this section include, but are not limited to:
 - (A) A Tribal enrollment card;
 - (B) A Certificate of Degree of Indian Blood;
 - (C) A Tribal census document;
 - (D) Documents on Tribal letterhead, issued under the signature of the appropriate Tribal official, that meet the requirements of <u>paragraph (a)(5)(i)</u> of this section."⁴



Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

- **OTP-Native Alaskan.1** The financing entity assesses an individual/owner/end user's status as Native Alaskan residing in Alaska with maintained Tribal affiliation or community attachment via collection of a government-issued or tribal government-issued photo identification.
 - (ii) Documents described in paragraph (a)(5)(i) of this section include, but are not limited to:
 - (A) A Tribal enrollment card;
 - (B) A Certificate of Degree of Indian Blood;
 - (C) A Tribal census document;
 - (D) Documents on Tribal letterhead, issued under the signature of the appropriate Tribal official, that meet the requirements of paragraph (a)(5)(i) of this section."4

Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

• **OTP-Native Hawaiian.1** – The financing entity assesses an individual/owner/end-user's status as Native Hawaiian residing in Hawaii via collection of a Hawaiian Registry Card.



Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

- **OTP-Hisp.1** Individual, owner, or end-user self-reports as Hispanic.
- OTP-Hisp.2 If the individual/owner/end-user self-report is not available, the financing entity visually assesses an individual's status as Hispanic in-person or via collection of a government-issued photo identification.
- OTP-Hisp.3 If the individual/owner/end-user self-report is not available, the financing entity may use the surname of an individual to determine status as Hispanic via collection of a government-issued photo identification or primary residence documentation. The surname must have a value of 80% or higher for the "Percent Hispanic or Latino origin" based off of the most recently available "Frequently Occurring Surnames" list from the U.S. Census Bureau.



- CDFI Fund has released list of 8,257 "Hispanic or Latino" surnames
 - XThey have not included any Bayesian Improved First Name/Surname Geocoding methodologies that are statistically more accurate, compliant with ECOA and Reg B, are endorsed by CFPB, and can be used for multiple races and ethnicities

Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

- **OTP-Hisp.1** Individual, owner, or end-user self-reports as Hispanic.
- **OTP-Hisp.2** If the individual/owner/end-user self-report is not available, the financing entity visually assesses an individual's status as Hispanic in-person or via collection of a government-issued photo identification.
- OTP-Hisp.3 If the individual/owner/end-user self-report is not available, the financing entity may use the surname of an individual to determine status as Hispanic via collection of a government-issued photo identification or primary residence documentation. The surname must have a value of 80% or higher for the "Percent Hispanic or Letino origin" based off of the most recently available "Frequently Occurring Surnames" list from the U.S. Census Bureau.



Target Market Type: Low Income Targeted Population (LITP)

Recipient Type Eligibility

- Individual: At least 50% of the individuals named as recipients in the Financial Product and/or Financial Services transaction agreement are assessed as Low-Income.
- For-Profit Entity: If all parties named as recipients in the Financial Product and/or
 Financial Services transaction agreement are for-profit entities that are wholly owned by
 one or more individuals (i.e., are not owned in whole or in part by another entity) and are
 not tax exempt, at least 50% of the owners named as recipient are assessed as LowIncome.
- Non-Profit Entity: If all parties named as recipients in the Financial Product and/or Financial Services transaction agreement are tax exempt, at least 50% of the end users of the Financial Product and/or Financial Services transaction are assessed as Low-Income.

Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

- LITP.1 The financing entity collects income data and primary residence or business
 location documentation from the individual, owner, or end-user and assesses LowIncome status via a comparison of the entire family income to HUD's Income Limits for
 the relevant family size and local geography.
- LITP.2 If the individual/owner/end-user income data is not available, the financing
 entity assesses Low-Income status using a programmatic proxy that the financing entity
 has confirmed applies an income limit that aligns with the CDFI Fund's definition of
 Low-Income and that meets one of the following conditions:
 - Verification that the Financial Product individual/owner/end-user has been approved to participate in a Federal, State, local or Tribal government program that is Low-Income directed.
 - Confirmation of income-based assistance program participation status for all of the community service provider's end-users.
 - Confirmation of clear, government-established/approved minimum standards regarding the percentage of the project slots that must be reserved for/occupied by Low-Income participants.

Pre-Approved Programmatic Proxies

The CDFI Fund will allow

- HOME Investment Partnership Program (HOME)
- Social Security Disability Insurance (SSDI) and/or Supplemental Security Income (SSI).
- Housing Choice Voucher Section 8
- Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Program
- Special Supplemental Nutrition Program for Woman, Infants, and Children (WIC) –
 Financing entity must ensure program eligibility income limits set at the state level
 align well with the CDFI Fund's definition of Low-Income

- Low-Income Targeted Population (LITP) methodologies begin on page 15
- Verification and documentation methodologies
 - >cannot be used to evaluate credit union loans at scale
 - cannot be used to evaluate credit union membership at all



Pre-Approved Assessment Methodologies

- LITP.1 The financing entity collects income data and primary residence or business location documentation from the individual, owner, or end-user and assesses Low-Income status via a comparison of the entire family income to HOD's Income Limits for the relevant family size and local geography
- LITP.2 If the individual/owner/end-user income data is not available, the financing entity assesses Low-Income status using a programmatic proxy that the financing entity has confirmed applies an income limit that aligns with the CDFI Fund's definition of Low-Income and that meets one of the following conditions:
 - Verification that the Financial Product individual/owner/end-user has been approved to participate in a Federal, State, local or Tribal government program that is Low-Income directed.
 - Confirmation of income-based assistance program participation status for all of the community service provider's end-users.
 - Confirmation of clear, government-established/approved minimum standards regarding the percentage of the project slots that must be reserved for/occupied by Low-Income participants.



Pre-Approved Programmatic Proxies

The CDFI Fund will allow

- HOME Investment Partnership Program (HOME)
- Social Security Disability Insurance (SSDI) and/or Supplemental Security Income (SSI).
- Housing Choice Voucher Section 8
- Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Program
- Special Supplemental Nutrition Program for Woman, Infants, and Children (WIC) Financing entity must ensure program eligibility income limits set at the state level align well with the CDFI Fund's definition of Low-Income
- Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP)/Food Stamps Financing entity must ensure program eligibility income limits set at the state level, align well with the CDFI Fund's definition of Low-Income
- National School Lunch Program (NSLP) -- Financing entity must ensure program eligibility income limits set at the state level align well with the CDFI Fund's definition of Low-Income



- Actual family income: The actual family size of the Financial Product consumer will be determined based on the U.S. Census Bureau's definition of family (currently includes any person living in the same dwelling unit that is related by birth, marriage or adoption). If the family size is unknown, then the default family size is one. If the family size is known, income data must be collected on all members of the family.
- The full family income of the Financial Product consumer must:
 - o be calculated based on the income type that must be included when determining adjusted gross income in an IRS 1040 form, family income for the U.S. Census Bureau or household income for HUD's Section 8 Program;
 - o include income of the relevant types received by any family member taken into account in the U.S. Census Bureau's definition of family income (currently includes any person age 15 and up who lives in the same dwelling unit and is related by birth, marriage or adoption) even if that family member does not file a tax return to report their income and/or have other formal documentation of the income; and
 - be documented via tax returns, W-2s, recent paystubs, employer affidavits, etc. or similar when such formal documentation is available, via less formal means, as needed, or via combinations of such documents as needed to establish the full relevant income of each relevant family member.

• For any proxy not shown on the Fund's publically available pre-approved proxy list, the Financing Entity must submit their proposed proxy for approval by the Fund. The proxy must be approved by the Fund prior to its use for Target Market assessment.



/ Target Market Verification /Low-Income Geographic Proxies

- The CDFI Fund has proposed the use of Low-Income Geographies as an LITP proxy, similar in principle to those
 - ➤ Used by NCUA for Low Income Designation
 - > Developed and used by Inclusiv for our current LITP analysis
- Inclusiv has long advocated for the CDFI Fund to make such standardized geographic proxies publicly available to all CDFIs
- They listened...sort of...



/ Target Market Verification /Low-Income Geographic Proxies

- The Census Block Group proxies proposed by the CDFI Fund:
 - ➤ Only classify 10% of the US population as "low-income"
 - >94% of people classified as "low-income" already live in qualified Investment Areas
 - >72% of NCUA's Low Income Census Block Groups are not classified as "low-income" by the CDFI Fund

4	А	В	С	D	Е	F	G
				Count of Low-Income	Count of all	Share of Low-	Share of Low-
	Census Block Group 12-digi	t		persons below 80%	persons for whom	Income	Income persons
1	FIPS	State 🔻	County ▼	of area income	income is availab	persons	is >= 70%
2	010010201001	Alabama	Autauga	230	650	35%	NO
3	010010201002	Alabama	Autauga	315	1300	24%	NO
4	010010202001	Alabama	Autauga	515	1075	48%	NO
5	010010202002	Alabama	Autauga	360	910	40%	NO
6	010010203001	Alabama	Autauga	580	2145	27%	NO
7	0100102022002	Alabama	Autougo	440	025	52%	NO



Target Market Verification /Low-Income Geographic Proxies

- The Census Block Group proxies proposed by the CDFI Fund:
 - ➤ Only classify 10% of the US population as "low-income"
 - >94% of people classified as "low-income" already live in qualified Investment Areas
 - >72% of NCUA's Low Income Census Block Groups are not classified as "low-income" by the CDFI Fund

Hypothetically...

if NCUA used the CDFI Fund's proposed low-income geographies, more than 2,400 credit unions would no longer be Low-Income Designated



Target Market Verification / Inclusiv Recommendations

- Inclusiv is proposing four modifications and additions to the pre-approved methodologies
- Our proposed methodologies would enable CDFIs of any scale to
 - ✓ Increase accuracy
 - ✓ Improve efficiency
 - ✓ Ensure regulatory compliance



Target Market Verification / Inclusiv Recommendations

- The categories of Inclusiv's four proposed modifications and additions are:
- 1. Investment Areas
- 2. Geographic Proxy for Low-Income
- 3. Modeled Household Income
- 4. Other Targeted Populations

Let's get nerdy!

/ inclusiv /



Inclusiv Recommendations / Investment Areas

1. Extend Qualified Investment Areas to Census Block Groups

- IAs are easiest Target Market to verify with 100% accuracy
 - Geocode address and match with list of qualified geocodes
- CDFI Fund has only ever designated IA Counties and IA Census Tracts, even though:



Inclusiv Recommendations / Investment Areas

1. Extend Qualified Investment Areas to Census Block Groups

- ✓ IAs are easiest Target Market to verify with 100% accuracy
- ✓ Most CDFIs would be able to certify based on IAs alone, without any need for OTP and/or LITP



Inclusiv Recommendations / Geographic Proxy for LITP

2. Use Low-Income Geographies as LITP Proxy based on IA criteria



Inclusiv Recommendations / Geographic Proxy for LITP

2. Use Low-Income Geographies as LITP Proxy based on IA criteria

- Investment Area criteria identify Low-Income Geographies
- CDFIs that only serve LITP could use this geographic proxy when unable to collect family income data
- Since LITP geographies are subset of Investment Areas, proxy will always identify borrowers that qualify for at least one eligible Target Market



Inclusiv Recommendations / Modeled Household Income

- 3. Accept use of modeled household income data from qualified third-party vendors* for LITP classification
- Low-Income benchmark based on total family income, adjusted for family size
- Credit unions have no business reason to collect family size and family income data from members, except perhaps small percentage of home mortgages applicants
- Leading providers of core data, MCIF and data analytics systems for banks and credit unions can provide "modeled" estimates of family income for all members based on hundreds of public sources of data for each household.
- Credit unions have used modeled income for LITP classification since early days of certification, as it provides more accurate estimate than geographic proxy or individual borrower income

^{*} Inclusiv does not offer these services and does not endorse any specific third-party vendor



Inclusiv Recommendations / Other Targeted Populations

- 4. Accept race/ethnicity coding based on Bayesian name/geocoding analyses from qualified third-party vendors*
- "Visual identification" of race/ethnicity violates regulations, cannot be conducted at scale and is of biased by subjective decisions of tens of thousands of front-line workers
- CFPB published a detailed methodology that combines of analyses of both names and geographic locations to determine probable race/ethnicity using Bayesian statistics
- Research has found these "Bayesian" methodologies to be much more accurate than use of surnames or geographic proxies on their own
- Multiple qualified third-party vendors offer race/ethnicity coding to banks and credit unions based on the CFPB or enhanced Bayesian methodologies

^{*} Inclusiv does not offer these services and does not endorse any specific third-party vendor



/ Target Market Verification / Inclusiv Recommendations

- 1. Investment Areas
 - ✓ Extend Investment Areas to Census Block Groups
- 2. Geographic Proxy for Low-Income
 - ✓ Use subset of Low-Income Investment Areas as LITP proxy
- 3. Modeled Household Income
 - ✓ Accept modeled household income data from qualified vendors for LITP determination
- 4. Other Targeted Populations
 - ✓ Accept race/ethnicity coding based on Bayesian name/geocoding analyses from qualified third-party vendors



/ Target Market Verification / Bonus Comment!

- CDFI Fund has yet to release proposed modifications of Transaction-Level Report that would be required as first step in certification application
- Current TLR is not suited to certification, e.g.
 - allows upload of Personally Identifiable Information that could be subject to public exposure
 - requires dozens of extraneous fields of data that have no bearing on certification tests
 - has not demonstrated capacity to handle millions of records

From Inclusiv Comments on Certification Application

CDFI Fund must as soon as possible release for public comment a complete draft of the modified TLR that prevents the upload of PII, and with clear explanations of how each required data will be used for determining eligibility for certification.

Audience Discussion

Upcoming Events



Inclusiv CDFI Certification Office Hours

Wednesday afternoons at 3pm ET

To register for the series:

https://forms.office.com/pages/responsepage.aspx?id=URkTPdR2J06IUEAfCbvyu3 PLJRJPufxLqGlvsP1qhthUMVlWWkVYTzBUSk9PQVdBM0ZQVEIJRUNSSS4u

/inclusiv./

Credit Union Network



Pablo DeFilippi SVP, Network Engagement Pablo@inclusiv.org 212.809.1850 ext. 304



Monica Copeland
Senior Program Officer
mcopeland@inclusiv.org



Jules Epstein-Hebert
Director of Membership
jhebert@inclusiv.org
212.809.1850 ext. 211



Chriselle Martinez
CDFI Program Director
cmartinez@inclusiv.org



Terry Ratigan
Senior Consultant
tratigan@inclusiv.org



Pablo DeFilippi
EVP Inclusiv CU Network
Email: pablo@inclusiv.org
Tel: 212.809.1850 ext. 304

Thank you! / inclusiv /

39 Broadway Suite 2140 New York, NY 10006-3003 www.inclusiv.org



Jules Epstein-Hebert
Director of Membership Growth and Partnerships
Email: jhebert@inclusiv.org
Tel: 212.809.1850 ext. 211

/inclusiv./